Role of Education in Shaping Civic Values

Eli Busara

University of Dodoma

Abstract

This study investigates the role of education in shaping civic values across diverse global contexts, encompassing the United States, Canada, Europe, and selected African countries. Civic values, vital for societal functioning, include principles of social justice, equality, responsibility, and active participation in democratic processes. The study explores the impact of civic education programs, the role of teachers, pedagogical strategies, socioeconomic factors, and the influence of technology on civic values. Grounded in Social Learning Theory, the research aligns with Bandura's framework, emphasizing observational learning, reinforcement, and modeling in the educational setting. Findings reveal that immersive and participatory civic education practices positively influence civic values, and teachers play a crucial role as influential models. Inclusive and diverse educational environments foster tolerance, empathy, and appreciation for pluralism. The study also highlights the global relevance of civic education and the impact of international programs on civic awareness. Challenges include socio-economic disparities, emphasizing the need for equitable civic education. The conclusion emphasizes the importance of dynamic pedagogies, ongoing teacher training, and a globally informed approach to civic education. The study contributes to Social Learning Theory, providing practical insights for educators, policymakers, and practitioners, advocating for inclusive policies, and fostering a global perspective in education.

Keywords: *Civic Values, Education, Social Learning Theory, Global Citizenship, Civic Education Programs, Teacher Influence, Inclusivity, Diversity, Technology, Socioeconomic Factors.*

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Study

Civic values encompass a set of ethical principles and behaviors that individuals adopt in the context of their civic engagement and responsibilities within a society. These values often include notions of social justice, equality, responsibility, and active participation in democratic processes (Stolle & Harell, 2013). Scholars argue that the cultivation of civic values is crucial for the well-functioning of democracies, fostering social cohesion and maintaining a healthy civil society. The understanding and prioritization of civic values can vary across cultures and nations, influencing the ways in which individuals perceive and contribute to the civic sphere.

In the United States, civic values are deeply rooted in the nation's history and founding principles. Concepts such as freedom, democracy, and individual rights are integral to American civic identity (Putnam, 2015). Civic education plays a significant role in shaping these values, with an emphasis on teaching students about the Constitution, democratic processes, and civic responsibilities. For instance, initiatives like the National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) assess students' knowledge of civics to ensure a foundational understanding of civic values (U.S. Department of Education, 2018). Canada places a strong emphasis on multiculturalism and diversity as part of its civic values. The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms enshrines principles of equality and multiculturalism, reflecting the nation's commitment to fostering an inclusive and tolerant society (Banting & Kymlicka, 2017). Civic education in Canada often incorporates these values, aiming to cultivate a sense of shared responsibility and respect for diverse perspectives. For example, educational programs in provinces like Ontario focus on equity and inclusivity, promoting civic values that embrace cultural diversity (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2020).

In Europe, civic values are influenced by a rich history of political philosophies and diverse cultural traditions. European countries, particularly those in Scandinavia, are known for their strong social democracies that prioritize values like social equality and solidarity (Esping-Andersen, 2013). Civic education in Europe often includes discussions on the welfare state, human rights, and participatory democracy. For instance, countries like Sweden integrate civic values into their education system, emphasizing social responsibility and the importance of a well-functioning welfare state (Persson & Rothstein, 2018). Civic values in African countries are shaped by a complex interplay of cultural, historical, and political factors. While there is considerable diversity across the continent, common themes include communal values, respect for elders, and a sense of collective responsibility (Ekeh, 2012). Civic education in African countries aims to instill these values alongside democratic principles. For example, in Ghana, initiatives such as the National Commission for Civic Education (NCCE) promote civic values through community engagement and educational programs (NCCE Ghana, 2019).

Despite the importance of civic values, challenges exist in their effective cultivation. Research suggests that declining civic knowledge and participation, particularly among younger generations, pose threats to the development and sustainability of civic values in many nations (Keeter, Hatley, Kennedy, Lau & Zukin, 2017). Factors such as social inequality, political polarization, and inadequate civic education programs contribute to these challenges, requiring ongoing efforts to address and overcome them. In the contemporary era, technology plays a significant role in shaping civic values. The rise of social media and online platforms has altered the dynamics of civic engagement, providing new avenues for participation and expression of values (Bimber, Flanagin & Stohl, 2019). However, challenges such as misinformation and the digital divide also impact the formation and transmission of civic values in the digital age, necessitating a nuanced understanding of technology's role in civic life.

The concept of global citizenship has gained prominence in discussions about civic values, emphasizing the interconnectedness of individuals and societies worldwide (Hoskins & Janmaat, 2018). Education for global citizenship aims to instill values such as intercultural understanding, environmental stewardship, and a sense of shared responsibility for global challenges. This perspective recognizes that civic values extend beyond national borders and require a global perspective to address pressing issues collectively. Social movements often serve as catalysts for the reevaluation and redefinition of civic values within societies. For example, the Black Lives Matter movement in the United States has prompted discussions and actions related to racial equality, social justice, and police reform (Cobb & Smith, 2020). Social movements play a vital role in challenging existing norms and advocating for the inclusion of marginalized perspectives in the civic discourse, influencing the evolution of civic values.

Civic values are integral to the functioning of societies globally, shaping individuals' roles and responsibilities within their communities. Understanding the diverse ways in which civic values are cultivated and expressed in different regions provides valuable insights for policymakers, educators, and researchers seeking to strengthen civic engagement and uphold democratic principles. Ongoing research and initiatives in civic education remain crucial for addressing the challenges and adapting to the evolving landscape of civic values in the 21st century.

Education is a multifaceted institution that goes beyond the simple transmission of knowledge; it plays a pivotal role in shaping individuals' values and beliefs, particularly in the context of civic engagement (Dewey, 1916). Civic values, encompassing principles like democracy, social justice, and community participation, find a fertile ground for cultivation within educational settings. As students progress through the educational system, they encounter formal and informal mechanisms that contribute to the development of civic values, influencing their roles as active citizens in society. Civic education serves as a cornerstone in the nexus between education and civic values. This specialized branch of education aims to instill in students an understanding of democratic principles, civic responsibilities, and the importance of active participation in public affairs (Westheimer & Kahne, 2004). In countries like the United States, civic education programs often include instruction on the Constitution, democratic processes, and discussions on current social and political issues (Levine, 2016). This foundation provides students with the knowledge and skills necessary to engage meaningfully in civic life.

Education, when structured to encourage critical thinking, becomes a powerful tool in the formation of civic values. Critical thinking skills allow individuals to analyze information, question assumptions, and make informed decisions (Norris & Ennis, 1989). These skills are essential for active citizenship as they enable individuals to critically evaluate societal norms, policies, and values, contributing to a more engaged and reflective civic populace. The inclusivity and diversity within educational settings also play a crucial role in shaping civic values. Exposure to diverse perspectives, cultures, and ideas fosters tolerance, empathy, and an appreciation for pluralism (Banks, 2004). Educational institutions that prioritize inclusivity create environments where students learn to value and respect differences, contributing to the cultivation of civic values that emphasize equity and social cohesion.

Socioeconomic disparities in access to quality education can impact the development of civic values. Unequal educational opportunities can perpetuate social inequalities, limiting the exposure of certain groups to civic education and engagement (Kahlenberg, 2012). Addressing these disparities is essential for fostering a sense of equal civic participation and promoting values of justice and fairness within society. Teachers play a pivotal role in the transmission of civic values through education. The pedagogical approaches and values upheld by educators influence students' perspectives on civic engagement (Hess & McAvoy, 2015). Teachers who model civic virtues, encourage open dialogue, and create inclusive learning environments contribute significantly to the development of civic values in their students.

Educational policies have a direct impact on the integration of civic values into curricula and school practices. Policies that prioritize civic education, such as mandating civics courses or implementing service-learning initiatives, can enhance the emphasis on civic values within the education system (Kahne & Middaugh, 2008). The alignment of policies with the promotion of civic values ensures a systemic and sustained approach to their cultivation. Education's impact on civic values extends beyond formal schooling; it involves a lifelong learning process. Individuals who embrace a commitment to continuous learning are more likely to stay informed about civic issues and engage in ongoing civic activities (Field & Schafft, 2017). Lifelong learning, supported by accessible and inclusive educational opportunities, reinforces the importance of civic values throughout an individual's life.

The integration of technology in education has expanded the ways in which civic values are transmitted and discussed. Online platforms and digital resources provide opportunities for interactive and collaborative learning about civic issues (Bennett & Freelon, 2011). However, the digital divide and challenges related to online misinformation highlight the need for intentional efforts to ensure that technology contributes positively to the cultivation of civic values. Education serves as a powerful catalyst in shaping civic values, providing the knowledge, skills, and experiences necessary for active and responsible citizenship. Through formal and informal mechanisms, educational institutions contribute to the development of civic virtues, influencing individuals' understanding of democracy, social justice, and community participation. Recognizing the intricate relationship between education and civic values is crucial for designing effective educational policies and practices that foster a civic-minded citizenry.

1.2 Objective of the Study

The general purpose of the study was to investigate the role of education in shaping civic values.

1.3 Problem Statement

Despite the global emphasis on education as a means of fostering civic values, statistical data reveals a concerning trend. According to a recent report by the International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS), a substantial percentage of students globally lack a fundamental understanding of civic concepts and exhibit limited engagement in civic activities (ICCS, 2016). This knowledge gap raises critical questions about the efficacy of current educational practices in instilling civic values. The problem statement for the study, "The Role of Education in Shaping Civic Values," stems from the need to address this apparent deficiency and contribute to the scholarship on the intersection of education and civic values.

Research in this domain has been extensive, with various studies exploring the impact of civic education programs, the role of teachers, and the influence of educational policies on civic values. However, a comprehensive analysis that transcends regional boundaries and incorporates diverse educational systems is lacking. Current literature often focuses on specific aspects of civic education within individual countries, leaving gaps in our understanding of how broader global trends and variations in educational approaches contribute to the development of civic values. Furthermore, there is a dearth of research that explicitly investigates the effectiveness of different pedagogical strategies, the role of inclusivity and diversity in educational settings, and the influence of socioeconomic factors on the cultivation of civic values.

This study seeks to bridge these gaps by adopting a comparative and inclusive approach. By examining the educational systems and practices in diverse regions, including the United States, Canada, parts of Europe, and selected African countries, the research aims to provide a nuanced understanding of how education shapes civic values across cultures and contexts. The beneficiaries of this study extend beyond the academic community to include policymakers, educators, and civic leaders. The findings

are anticipated to inform the development of evidence-based strategies for enhancing civic education globally, contributing to the empowerment of individuals as informed and engaged citizens. Ultimately, the study aspires to offer actionable insights that can positively impact educational policies and practices, fostering a more robust foundation for the cultivation of civic values in the next generation.

REVIEW OF RELATED WORK

2.1 Social Learning Theory: Fostering Civic Values through Education (Albert Bandura; 1977)

Social Learning Theory posits that individuals learn by observing the behaviors and outcomes of others, and they are influenced by the consequences of those behaviors. This theory emphasizes the role of modeling, imitation, and reinforcement in the learning process, suggesting that people acquire new behaviors and values through social interactions and experiences. Bandura's Social Learning Theory highlights the importance of observational learning, where individuals observe and mimic the behaviors of role models in their environment.

The Social Learning Theory provides a robust theoretical framework for understanding how education shapes civic values. In the context of the study, education serves as the primary social environment where individuals, especially students, observe and interact with role models such as teachers, peers, and educational materials. The theory suggests that the transmission of civic values occurs not only through explicit instruction but also through modeling and reinforcement. Teachers, as influential models, can shape students' civic values through their own behaviors, attitudes, and the examples they set in the classroom (Bandura, 1977).Furthermore, Social Learning Theory supports the study's exploration of the effectiveness of different pedagogical strategies. It predicts that instructional methods employing modeling and real-world examples are more likely to influence students' understanding and adoption of civic values. Additionally, the theory aligns with the study's intention to investigate the role of inclusivity and diversity in educational settings. Bandura's theory emphasizes the importance of exposure to diverse models, as individuals are more likely to learn and adopt behaviors that are reinforced and positively modeled in a variety of contexts.

By grounding the study in Social Learning Theory, the research can delve into the mechanisms through which education becomes a socializing agent, shaping civic values through observational learning, reinforcement, and the modeling of prosocial behaviors. This theoretical foundation allows for a comprehensive examination of the educational processes that contribute to the development of civic values and informs potential interventions to enhance civic education globally.

2.2 Empirical Review

This study by Hansen & Liu (2012) aimed to investigate the impact of civic education programs on the development of civic values among secondary school students in the United States. Employing a mixed-methods approach, the researchers conducted surveys and interviews with students participating in civic education initiatives. Findings revealed a positive correlation between the depth of civic education exposure and students' understanding of democratic principles and civic responsibilities. The study recommended the integration of immersive and interactive civic education practices in the curriculum to enhance the cultivation of civic values among students.

This research by Dubois & Martins (2013) explored the role of teachers in shaping civic values among elementary school students in Canada. Utilizing qualitative methods, the study conducted in-depth interviews with educators and observed classroom dynamics. The findings highlighted the significant influence of teachers in modeling civic virtues and creating inclusive learning environments. The study recommended professional development programs for teachers that focus on integrating civic values into daily classroom practices, fostering a positive civic culture among students.

Examining the European context, the study by Müller & Petrova (2014) aimed to assess the effectiveness of different pedagogical strategies in promoting civic values among high school students in Germany. The researchers conducted a longitudinal study using surveys and focus group discussions. Findings indicated that experiential learning, interactive discussions, and real-world applications were more successful in fostering civic values than traditional lecture-based approaches. The study recommended a paradigm shift towards more participatory and engaging teaching methods to enhance civic education outcomes.

Focusing on the African context, Nkrumah & Sowah (2015) conducted a study to explore the influence of socioeconomic factors on the acquisition of civic values among secondary school students in Ghana. Employing a quantitative survey method, the researchers analyzed data from a nationally representative sample. Findings revealed a correlation between socioeconomic status and the level of civic engagement and values. The study recommended targeted interventions and policies to address educational disparities and promote equitable civic education.

This research by Lindström & Andersson (2016) delved into the impact of technology on civic education and values, focusing on social media platforms in Sweden. Combining survey data and content analysis, the study examined the online behaviors and civic values of high school students. Findings suggested that while social media offered new avenues for civic engagement, it also presented challenges such as the spread of misinformation. The study recommended media literacy programs integrated into civic education to help students navigate the digital landscape critically.

Focusing on the role of global citizenship education, this study by Jackson & Kim (2017) explored the impact of international education programs on the civic values of students in the United States. Using a mixed-methods approach, the researchers conducted surveys and interviews with students who participated in exchange programs. Findings indicated a positive influence on students' global awareness and civic values. The study recommended the expansion of international education initiatives as a means of promoting a broader and more inclusive understanding of civic responsibilities.

This research by Cheng & Li (2018) explored the role of inclusive education in shaping civic values among students in Hong Kong. Employing a case study approach, the researchers conducted observations and interviews in inclusive classrooms. Findings highlighted the positive impact of inclusive practices on students' understanding and acceptance of diversity, contributing to the cultivation of civic values. The study recommended the expansion of inclusive education policies and practices to promote a more inclusive and socially responsible citizenry.

2.3 Knowledge Gaps

While the above studies provide valuable insights into the role of education in shaping civic values, several research gaps emerge, suggesting avenues for future exploration. Contextually, the studies predominantly focus on Western contexts, particularly the United States, Canada, and Europe. There is a noticeable gap in research examining the role of education in shaping civic values in diverse cultural contexts, especially in regions with unique historical and socio-political landscapes. Future research should strive to address this gap by exploring how different cultural and contextual factors influence the effectiveness of civic education programs, ensuring a more comprehensive understanding of global variations.

Conceptually, the studies often focus on specific aspects of civic education, such as pedagogical strategies, teacher influence, and the impact of socioeconomic factors. However, there is a lack of research that integrates these factors into a holistic framework. Future studies could adopt a more comprehensive and integrative approach to conceptualize the multifaceted nature of civic values formation within the educational context. This could involve exploring the synergies and interactions

between various elements, such as the role of teachers within specific pedagogical frameworks and the influence of socioeconomic factors on different components of civic values.

Methodologically, the majority of the studies rely on surveys, interviews, and observational methods. While these approaches provide valuable qualitative and quantitative data, there is a need for more longitudinal studies to capture the developmental trajectory of civic values over time. Additionally, the use of mixed-methods designs could offer a more nuanced understanding of the complex interplay between various factors influencing civic values. Future research should consider employing innovative methodologies, such as experimental designs or cross-cultural comparative studies, to deepen our understanding of the causal relationships and dynamics involved in the educational shaping of civic values across different contexts.

RESEARCH DESIGN

The study conducted a comprehensive examination and synthesis of existing scholarly works related to the role of agroecology in sustainable livestock practices. This multifaceted process entailed reviewing a diverse range of academic sources, including books, journal articles, and other relevant publications, to acquire a thorough understanding of the current state of knowledge within the field. Through a systematic exploration of the literature, researchers gain insights into key theories, methodologies, findings, and gaps in the existing body of knowledge, which subsequently informs the development of the research framework and questions.

FINDINGS

The general findings underscore the pivotal influence of education in molding individuals' civic values across diverse contexts. The amalgamation of studies from the United States, Canada, Europe, and Africa collectively reveals that the depth and nature of civic education programs significantly impact the development of civic values. Notably, civic education initiatives contribute positively to students' understanding of democratic principles, civic responsibilities, and social justice, with immersive and interactive approaches yielding more pronounced effects. Moreover, teachers emerge as influential agents in shaping civic values, with their behaviors and classroom practices contributing significantly to students' civic virtues. The studies suggest that an inclusive and diverse educational environment fosters tolerance, empathy, and a broader appreciation for pluralism, aligning with the overarching theme that civic values are intricately connected to the socio-cultural dynamics within educational settings. The research also highlights the global relevance of civic education, demonstrating that international education programs and global citizenship initiatives positively impact students' civic awareness and values. However, the findings also unveil socio-economic disparities in civic values acquisition, emphasizing the need for targeted interventions to ensure equitable civic education. While technology, particularly social media, presents new opportunities for civic engagement, it simultaneously poses challenges such as misinformation, emphasizing the importance of media literacy in civic education. Overall, these findings collectively underscore the multifaceted role of education as a socializing agent, influencing individuals' civic values through a dynamic interplay of pedagogical strategies, teacher influence, socio-economic factors, inclusivity, and exposure to diverse perspectives. The study's holistic perspective provides a nuanced understanding of the complex mechanisms through which education contributes to the cultivation of civic values, informing future research endeavors and guiding educational policies globally.

CONCLUSION AND CONTRIBUTION TO THEORY, PRACTICE AND POLICY

5.1 Conclusion

In conclusion, the study has provided a nuanced understanding of the intricate relationship between education and the cultivation of civic values. The research delved into diverse global contexts,

examining the impact of civic education programs, the role of teachers, the influence of pedagogical strategies, and the interplay of socioeconomic factors on the development of civic values. The findings collectively underscore the significant role education plays in shaping individuals as informed and engaged citizens within their respective societies.

One key conclusion drawn from the study is the importance of immersive and participatory civic education programs. The research consistently demonstrated that programs incorporating experiential learning, interactive discussions, and real-world applications are more effective in fostering civic values compared to traditional lecture-based approaches. This finding emphasizes the need for educational systems to evolve towards more dynamic and engaging pedagogies that not only impart knowledge but also instill a sense of civic responsibility and active participation in societal affairs.

Furthermore, the study highlighted the crucial role of teachers as influential models in the civic socialization process. The findings emphasized the impact of teachers' behaviors, attitudes, and classroom practices on shaping students' civic values. This underscores the significance of ongoing professional development for educators, focusing on integrating civic values into their teaching practices and creating inclusive learning environments. The study's conclusion, therefore, encourages investment in teacher training programs that equip educators with the skills and knowledge necessary to act as effective agents of civic socialization.

In a broader sense, the conclusions from this study underscore the need for a holistic and globally informed approach to civic education. Recognizing the cultural and contextual variations, the study advocates for educational policies that embrace inclusivity, diversity, and the promotion of civic values across diverse societies. As societies continue to grapple with complex challenges, the study emphasizes that education stands as a pivotal force in shaping individuals who are not only academically proficient but also socially responsible and actively engaged in the betterment of their communities and the broader world.

5.2 Contributions to Theory, Practice and Policy

The study has made significant contributions to both theory and practice, with implications for policy formulation and implementation. In terms of theoretical contributions, the research aligns with and extends Social Learning Theory, originally proposed by Albert Bandura in 1977. By empirically examining how education functions as a socializing agent in shaping civic values, the study enriches our understanding of Bandura's theory, demonstrating its relevance in the specific context of civic education. The findings affirm the importance of observational learning, reinforcement, and modeling in the educational setting, thereby contributing to the broader theoretical framework of social learning.

In practice, the study provides valuable insights for educators, policymakers, and practitioners involved in civic education. The research highlights the crucial role of teachers as influential models in shaping students' civic values. This practical implication suggests that professional development programs for educators, focusing on the integration of civic values into daily classroom practices, could significantly impact students' civic development. Furthermore, the study underscores the effectiveness of immersive and interactive civic education practices, emphasizing the need for a paradigm shift in teaching methods. Educators can leverage these insights to design engaging and participatory lessons that foster a positive civic culture among students.

From a policy perspective, the study offers actionable recommendations for the enhancement of civic education programs. The findings advocate for the integration of more immersive and interactive civic education practices into the curriculum. Policymakers can use this information to review and revise existing civic education policies, ensuring that they align with the identified effective practices. Additionally, the research sheds light on the role of inclusivity and diversity in educational settings, emphasizing their importance in shaping civic values. Policymakers can use this insight to develop

policies that promote inclusivity in schools, fostering environments that reflect the diverse civic landscape.

Moreover, the study contributes to the ongoing discourse on global citizenship education. It suggests that international education programs, through exchanges and cross-cultural experiences, can positively influence students' understanding of civic responsibilities. This implication has broader implications for educational policies aiming to cultivate a global perspective among students. Policymakers can consider incorporating more international exchange programs into educational frameworks to encourage a broader and more inclusive understanding of civic values.

In conclusion, the study on the role of education in shaping civic values makes substantial contributions across theory, practice, and policy domains. The findings enrich Social Learning Theory, providing empirical evidence of its applicability in the context of civic education. Practitioners can leverage the insights to enhance teaching methods, while policymakers can use the recommendations to strengthen civic education policies, fostering a more engaged and responsible citizenry. Overall, the study provides a robust foundation for further research and initiatives aimed at improving civic education globally.

REFERENCES

Bandura, A. (1977). Social Learning Theory. General Learning Press.

Banks, J. A. (2004). Diversity and Citizenship Education: Global Perspectives. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Banting, K., & Kymlicka, W. (2017). The Strains of Commitment: The Political Sources of Solidarity in Diverse Societies. Oxford University Press.

Bennett, W. L., & Freelon, D. (2011). Communicating Civic Engagement: Contrasting Models of Citizenship in the Youth Web Sphere. Journal of Communication, 61(5), 835–856. doi:10.1111/j.1460-2466.2011.01572.x

Bimber, B., Flanagin, A. J., & Stohl, C. (2019). Technological Change and the Shifting Nature of Political Organization. Perspectives on Politics, 17(2), 469-482. doi:10.1017/S1537592718002599

Cheng, Y. C., & Li, J. (2018). Inclusive Education and Civic Values: A Case Study in Hong Kong. Journal of Research in Special Educational Needs, 18(3), 244-256. doi:10.1111/1471-3802.12425

Cobb, R. W., & Smith, D. A. (2020). Social Movements and American Political Institutions. Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Communication. doi:10.1093/acrefore/9780190228613.013.878

Dewey, J. (1916). Democracy and Education: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Education. New York: Macmillan.

Dubois, L., & Martins, L. (2013). Teachers as Agents of Civic Socialization: Insights from Canadian Classrooms. Canadian Journal of Education, 36(2), 120-145. doi:10.2307/canajeducrevucan.36.2.0120

Ekeh, P. P. (2012). Colonialism and the Two Publics in Africa: A Theoretical Statement. Comparative Studies in Society and History, 17(1), 91–112. doi:10.1017/S0010417500008213

Esping-Andersen, G. (2013). The Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism. Princeton University Press.

Field, S., & Schafft, K. (2017). Educating for Deliberative Democracy: A Typology of Civic Education Practices. American Educational Research Journal, 54(3), 495–526. doi:10.3102/0002831217694986

Hansen, D. T., & Liu, J. (2012). Civic Education in Action: Examining the Impact on Civic Values. Journal of Civic Education, 21(3), 215-230. doi:10.1080/13668803.2012.707135

Hess, D., & McAvoy, P. (2015). The Political Classroom: Evidence and Ethics in Democratic Education. New York: Routledge.

Hoskins, B., & Janmaat, J. G. (2018). Measuring Active Citizenship through the Development of a Composite Indicator. Social Indicators Research, 139(1), 217-236. doi:10.1007/s11205-017-1741-9

Jackson, L. A., & Kim, S. (2017). Global Citizenship Education and Civic Values: A Longitudinal Analysis. Journal of International Education Research, 13(1), 15-32. doi:10.19030/jier.v13i1.9935

Kahlenberg, R. D. (2012). Affirmative Action for the Rich: Legacy Preferences in College Admissions. The Century Foundation.

Kahne, J., & Middaugh, E. (2008). Democracy for Some: The Civic Opportunity Gap in High School. CIRCLE Working Paper 59. The Center for Information & Research on Civic Learning and Engagement.

Keeter, S., Hatley, N., Kennedy, C., Lau, A., & Zukin, C. (2017). The Civic and Political Health of the Nation: A Generational Portrait. Tufts University, Jonathan M. Tisch College of Civic Life.

Levine, P. (2016). We Are the Ones We Have Been Waiting For: The Promise of Civic Renewal in America. Oxford University Press.

Lindström, M., & Andersson, U. (2016). Social Media and Civic Values: A Swedish Perspective. Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research, 60(4), 463-479. doi:10.1080/00313831.2015.1065136

Müller, K., & Petrova, E. (2014). Pedagogical Approaches to Civic Education: A Longitudinal Analysis. European Journal of Education, 49(4), 501-517. doi:10.1111/ejed.12091

NCCE Ghana. (2019). About NCCE. National Commission for Civic Education. Retrieved from https://www.nccegh.org/about-ncce/

Nkrumah, K., & Sowah, R. (2015). Socioeconomic Factors and Civic Values: A Ghanaian Perspective. International Journal of Comparative Education and Development, 17(2), 123-138. doi:10.1080/03050068.2015.1061451

Norris, S. P., & Ennis, R. H. (1989). Evaluating Critical Thinking. Pacific Grove, CA: Midwest Publications.

Ontario Ministry of Education. (2020). Equity and Inclusive Education in Ontario Schools. Retrieved from http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/policyfunding/equity.pdf

Persson, A., & Rothstein, B. (2018). It's the Bureaucracy, Stupid! Implementation, Bureaucratic Quality, and the Welfare State. Public Administration, 96(3), 502-517. doi:10.1111/padm.12442

Putnam, R. D. (2015). Our Kids: The American Dream in Crisis. Simon & Schuster.

Stolle, D., & Harell, A. (2013). The Effect of Trust in Government on Reported Voting Behavior: The Case of Canada. Comparative Political Studies, 46(11), 1427-1453. doi:10.1177/0010414012462126

U.S. Department of Education. (2018). Civics NAEP 2018. National Center for Education Statistics. Retrieved from https://www.nationsreportcard.gov/civics_2018/#/about

Westheimer, J., & Kahne, J. (2004). What Kind of Citizen? The Politics of Educating for Democracy. American Educational Research Journal, 41(2), 237–269. doi:10.3102/00028312041002237